



DRAFT MINUTES

San Francisco County Transportation Authority

Tuesday, February 15, 2022

1. Roll Call

Chair Mandelman called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m.

Present at Roll Call: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (10)

Absent at Roll Call: Commissioner Haney (1)

Chair Mandelman made a motion to excuse Commissioner Haney from the meeting, which was approved without objection.

2. Chair's Report - INFORMATION

Chair Mandelman began the meeting in memory of District 8 resident, J Church rider, and veteran transit and disability advocate Bob Planthold, who died earlier in the month. He noted Mr. Planthold was a longtime advocate for seniors, pedestrians, and people with disabilities, seeking for all to have access to safe, affordable, and reliable transportation. He also noted Mr. Planthold as an early leader with the Senior Disability Action organization and volunteered on numerous advisory committees and task forces throughout the city and region, including the SFMTA Paratransit Council, Mayor's Disability Council, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC)'s Policy Advisory Committee, the Association of Bay Area Governments' Housing Methodology Committee, and most recently on the Transbay Joint Powers Authority (TJPA)'s Citizens Advisory Committee. The Chair continued that Mr. Planthold was owed a great debt for making streets and transit better for everyone and wanted to close the meeting in Mr. Planthold's memory.

Chair Mandelman also thanked and congratulated Commissioner Ronen and staff for advocating for funding endorsements from the MTC for Muni's Core Capacity Program and TJPA's Downtown Rail Extension project at a recent meeting and said the Board looked forward to working with the region to advocate for all of the Bay Area's transportation priorities, including Caltrain electrification and BART Core Capacity in the state budget process. He continued the region's needs were large, many, and varied and prioritization would not be easy but he was hopeful that working together with partner entities like the state, they could increase funding sources for transportation, green infrastructure, and well-paying jobs.

Chair Mandelman concluded his remarks by thanking the staff, the Mayor's Office, and City departments for joining himself and Vice Chair Peskin for an executive roundtable discussion last month as part of the Transportation Authority's Capital Projects Delivery Study. He said the study is seeking to identify ways to improve project delivery outcomes for transportation projects in San Francisco. He continued that the team had a robust discussion of the barriers to efficient capital project delivery and identified the initial strategies, policies, and practices that could help



produce better results for large, complex infrastructure projects in the city. The Chair said he was hopeful that through the study and its resulting findings and recommendations that the city could find ways to raise the bar significantly on multi-agency collaboration and accountability in the transportation sector.

There was no public comment.

3. Executive Director's Report - INFORMATION

Tilly Chang, Executive Director, presented the item.

There was no public comment.

4. Approve the Minutes of the February 8, 2022 Meeting - ACTION*

There was no public comment.

Commissioner Preston moved to approve the minutes, seconded by Commissioner Chan.

The minutes were approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (10)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (1)

Consent Agenda

5. **[Final Approval] Appoint Kat Siegal to the Community Advisory Committee - ACTION***
6. **[Final Approval] Adopt Fiscal Year 2022/23 Transportation Fund for Clean Air Local Expenditure Criteria - ACTION***
7. **[Final Approval] Approve the 2022 State and Federal Legislative Program - ACTION***
8. **[Final Approval] Award Contracts to Ten Shortlisted Consultant Teams for a Three-Year Period, with an Option to Extend for Two Additional One-Year Periods, for a Combined Amount Not to Exceed \$3,000,000 for On-Call Transportation Planning Services and Authorize the Executive Director to Negotiate Contract Payment Terms and Non-Material Contract Terms and Conditions - ACTION***

Commissioner Preston moved to approve the consent agenda, seconded by Commissioner Chan.

The consent agenda was approved without objection by the following vote:

Ayes: Commissioners Chan, Mar, Mandelman, Melgar, Peskin, Preston, Ronen, Safai, Stefani, and Walton (10)

Absent: Commissioner Haney (1)

End of Consent Agenda

9. **Internal Accounting Report, Investment Report, and Debt Expenditure Report for the Six Months Ending December 31, 2021 - INFORMATION**

Cynthia Fong, Deputy Director for Administration and Finance, presented the item.



There was no public comment.

10. San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Transit Recovery Update - INFORMATION

Jeffrey Tumlin, Director of Transportation with SFMTA, introduced the item and Julie Kirschbaum, Director of Transit with SFMTA, presented the item.

Commissioner Preston thanked Ms. Kirschbaum for the presentation and appreciated how hard the situation was for SFMTA. He observed the city was in a daily public transit crisis with lines overcrowded, delayed, or without service and some lines still suspended after two years. Commissioner Preston acknowledged the disappointment that transit riders had with further delay of restoration of service. He said he didn't sense from anyone in City leadership that the situation was being treated as a crisis requiring an emergency response as with other aspects of city life like trash cleanup, noting transit riders were being left at the curb with their needs going unmet. Commissioner Preston continued that most city leaders were not riding public transit every day and a big portion of the city didn't ride transit. He asked Director Tumlin what was being done at a leadership level, including the Mayor's office, operators' union, etc., to figure this out and what were the asks to move the city forward.

Director Tumlin replied that SFMTA had been repeating consistently throughout the pandemic that there was no path to full service restoration without new revenues. He said SFMTA was dependent on the voters to approve new revenues and were challenged because of the way San Franciscans were suffering economically. Director Tumlin said the city could look to the San Francisco Board of Supervisors (BOS) to help with the path to service restoration and welcomed partnership with the BOS and were happy to share the strategy work that SFMTA was doing at the SFMTA Board.

Commissioner Preston responded that funding wasn't the barrier.

Director Tumlin reiterated that the barrier was funding, clarifying that hiring impacted the pace of restoration but funding remained a crisis despite the temporary relief of federal assistance that had helped the agency delay 1200 agency-wide layoffs. He continued that there was no other path for the agency to get funding relief for the past two years despite persistent efforts and the agency was completely dependent upon the voters to approve new funding streams. Director Tumlin acknowledge the economic challenges given the ways San Franciscans had been suffering economically during this crisis and said SFMTA looked to partner with the BOS to create solutions.

Commissioner Preston reiterated his question about what leadership, as a whole, could do to treat the situation as a crisis and move the city forward to restoration of service and said funding was not the barrier, that service would still be down even with funding in place. He asked Director Tumlin to explain the continued delays which had to do with the omnicron variant, staffing, and a number of issues not related to funding.

Director Tumlin responded that funding was in fact the primary barrier to service restoration and that the pace of restoration was related to the agency's ability to hire and train new employees. He said the pandemic was also affecting the agency's workforce numbers, noting the larger amount of COVID infection cases in operators at the beginning of 2022 exceeding all of 2021.



Commissioner Preston asked about the impact of the pandemic that had led to the 25% reduction from already depleted service and what was being done about it.

Director Tumlin answered that the agency was protecting the health and safety of its workforce and customers.

Commissioner Preston asked what was being done at a leadership level in the city to get the support the agency needed to address and minimize the impacts of an additional three-month delay for further service restoration and the unreliability of the system to get people around and what were the asks of other policy bodies in how they could assist to minimize the immediate crisis.

Director Tumlin answered there was nothing the BOS could do to help the agency with the immediate public health crisis of the pandemic. He emphasized that the agency needed the BOS's assistance find a path to ongoing and sustained service restoration which was entirely about funding.

Commissioner Preston responded that he would love to see the asks from all the stakeholders of how to support and see an emergency response to the situation. He said he appreciated the updates and the transparency on the problems but did not see solutions being offered to the short-term problem. Commissioner Preston asked if there were ways like additional bonuses to get staff to do more shifts and commented he saw nothing proposed that would change things in the next few weeks or months. He continued that if San Francisco was a transit first city and serious about people using public transportation, city leadership should address these short-term problems and Muni should be fare free since people could not rely on the public transit system in San Francisco.

Commissioner Chan thanked Commissioner Preston for his line of questioning and agreed that there were limited options, whether people relied mainly on public transit to get around or used it occasionally, and even if people wanted to support public transit, they couldn't depend on it in their daily lives. She expressed that she would like to ride transit but it was frustrating to constantly see announcements about serious delays and route options for her were limited as well. Commissioner Chan concurred with Commissioner Preston's call for a sense of urgency and agreed with the analogy of treating the situation as a daily livelihood need like trash collection. She said she was disappointed to hear about further delays until June and looked forward to more information and data.

There was no public comment.

11. Introduction of New Items - INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

12. Public Comment

There was no general public comment.

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned in honor of Bob Planthold at 11:02 a.m.