



RESOLUTION APPROVING PART 1 OF THE FISCAL YEAR 2018/19 TRANSPORTATION FUND FOR CLEAN AIR PROGRAM OF PROJECTS, PROGRAMMING \$388,003 TO FOUR PROJECTS, AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO EXECUTE A CONTRACT WITH THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT FOR \$811,737 IN FISCAL YEAR 2018/19 FUNDS AND TO ENTER INTO AGREEMENTS WITH APPLICABLE PUBLIC AGENCIES, ESTABLISHING CONDITIONS FOR THE USE OF THESE FUNDS

WHEREAS, On June 15, 1992, the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco designated the San Francisco County Transportation Authority (Transportation Authority) as the Program Manager of the local guaranteed portion of the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) funds; and

WHEREAS, As County Program Manager, the Transportation Authority is required to file an expenditure plan application with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (Air District) for the upcoming fiscal year's funding cycle, which was submitted to the Air District on March 5, 2018; and

WHEREAS, After netting out 6.25% (\$47,494) for administrative expenses, as allowed by Air District guidelines, and including deobligated and previously unallocated funds, the Transportation Authority has \$764,243 in Fiscal Year (FY) 2018/19 TFCA funds to program to eligible projects; and

WHEREAS, On March 2, 2018, the Transportation Authority solicited applications for projects for FY 2018/19 TFCA funds, and by April 20, 2018, received six applications requesting a total of \$1,209,996 in TFCA funds compared to \$764,243 available; and

WHEREAS, Transportation Authority staff, working in consultation with project sponsors, reviewed and prioritized the applications for funding based on Air District TFCA guidelines and the Transportation Authority's adopted Local Expenditure Criteria (Resolution 18-36); and

WHEREAS, The Transportation Authority's adopted Local Expenditure Criteria, shown in



Attachment 1, include review of eligibility per the Air District's guidelines, calculation of the cost effectiveness ratio for each project, and other factors; and

WHEREAS, Transportation Authority staff recommended programming a total of \$388,003 to four of the six candidate projects and placing the remaining \$376,249 on reserve to be programmed through a subsequent call for projects as shown in Attachments 2 and 3; and

WHEREAS, At its June 27, 2018 meeting, the Citizens Advisory Committee was briefed and unanimously adopted a motion of support for the staff recommendation which, at the time, included a recommendation to fund San Francisco State University's Ford GoBike Memberships for SF State Students project; and

WHEREAS, On July 2, 2018, subsequent to the Citizens Advisory Committee meeting, Lyft announced that it had acquired Motivate, the operator of Ford GoBike, and to be consistent with past Board policy direction that these public funds are not to be used on rides provided by Transportation Network Companies (TNCs such as Lyft and Uber), and at the request of Chair Peskin, staff are no longer recommending funds for the Ford GoBike Memberships for SF State Students project; and

WHEREAS, after discussing the item, the Board directed staff to invite Lyft and San Francisco State University representatives to a future meeting to answer questions raised by the Board about the Ford GoBike Memberships for SF State Students project so that the Board could consider whether or not to direct TFCA funds to the project; now, therefore, be it

RESOLVED, That the Transportation Authority hereby approves programming a total of \$388,003 to four projects in FY 2018/19 TFCA funds and placing the remaining \$376,240 on reserve to be programmed through a subsequent call for projects as shown in Attachment 2 and 3; and

RESOLVED, That the Executive Director is authorized to execute any agreements with the Air District necessary to secure \$764,243 for projects and \$47,494 for administrative expenses for a total of \$811,737 in FY 2018/19 TFCA Program Manager funds; and be it further



RESOLVED, That the Executive Director is authorized to execute funding agreements with each implementing agency to pass-through these funds for implementation of projects, establishing such terms and conditions governing cash drawdowns, financial and program audits, and reporting as necessary to comply with the requirements imposed by the Air District for the use of the funds and as required by the Transportation Authority in order to optimize the use of these of funds.

Attachments (3):

Attachment 1 - FY 2018/19 TFCA Local Expenditure Criteria

Attachment 2 - FY 2018/19 TFCA Program of Projects – Detailed Staff Recommendation

Attachment 3 - FY 2018/19 TFCA Program of Projects – Summary of Staff Recommendation



The foregoing Resolution was approved and adopted by the San Francisco County Transportation Authority at a regularly scheduled meeting thereof, this 24th day of July, 2018, by the following votes:

**Ayes:** Commissioners Brown, Cohen, Fewer, Kim, Peskin Ronen, Stefani and Yee (8)

**Absent:** Commissioners Mandelman, Safai and Tang (3)

 7-24-18

Aaron Peskin  
Chair

Date

ATTEST:

 7/26/18

Tilly Chang  
Executive Director

Date



## Attachment 1

### Fiscal Year 2018/19 Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA)

#### LOCAL EXPENDITURE CRITERIA (Adopted 2/27/2018)

The following are the Fiscal Year 2018/19 Local Expenditure Criteria for San Francisco's TFCA County Program Manager Funds.

#### ELIGIBILITY SCREENING

In order for projects to be considered for funding, they must meet the eligibility requirements established by the Air District's TFCA County Program Manager Fund Policies for Fiscal Year 2018/19. Consistent with the policies, a key factor in determining eligibility is a project's cost effectiveness (CE) ratio. The TFCA CE ratio is designed to measure the cost effectiveness of a project in reducing motor vehicle air pollutant emissions and to encourage projects that contribute funding from non-TFCA sources. TFCA funds budgeted for the project are divided by the project's estimated emissions reduction. The estimated reduction is the weighted sum of reactive organic gases (ROG), oxides of nitrogen (NO<sub>x</sub>), and particulate matter (PM) emissions that will be reduced over the effective life of the project, as defined by the Air District's guidelines.

TFCA CE is calculated by inputting information provided by the applicant into the Air District's CE worksheets. Transportation Authority staff will be available to assist project sponsors with these calculations, and will work with Air District staff and the project sponsors as needed to verify reasonableness of input variables. The worksheets also calculate reductions in carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions, which are not included in the Air District's official CE calculations, but which the Transportation Authority considers in its project prioritization process.

**Consistent with the Air District's Guidelines, in order to be eligible for Fiscal Year 2018/19 TFCA funds, a project must meet the CE ratio for emissions (i.e., ROG, NO<sub>x</sub>, and PM) reductions as specified in the guidelines for each project type. Projects that do not meet the appropriate CE threshold cannot be considered for funding.**

#### PROJECT PRIORITIZATION

Candidate projects that meet the cost effectiveness thresholds will be prioritized for funding based on the two-step process described below:

**Step 1** - TFCA funds are programmed to eligible projects, as prioritized using the Transportation Authority Board-adopted Local Priorities (see next page).

**Step 2** – If there are TFCA funds left unprogrammed after Step 1, the Transportation Authority will work with project sponsors to develop additional TFCA candidate projects. This may include refinement of projects that were submitted for Step 1, but were not deemed eligible, as well as new projects. This approach is in response to an Air District policy that does not allow County Program Managers to rollover any unprogrammed funds to the next year's funding cycle. If Fiscal Year 2018/19 funds are not programmed within 6 months of the Air District's approval of San Francisco's funding allocation, expected in June 2018, funds can be redirected (potentially to non-San Francisco projects) at the Air

District's discretion. New candidate projects must meet all TFCA eligibility requirements and will be prioritized based on the Transportation Authority Board's adopted Local Priorities.

### **Local Priorities**

The Transportation Authority's Local Priorities for prioritizing TFCA funds include the following factors:

**Project Type** – In order of priority:

- 1) Zero emissions non-vehicle projects including, but not limited to, bicycle and pedestrian facility improvements, transit priority projects, traffic calming projects, and transportation demand management projects;
- 2) Shuttle services that reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT);
- 3) Alternative fuel vehicles and alternative fuel infrastructure; and
- 4) Any other eligible project.

**Emissions Reduced and Cost Effectiveness** – Priority will be given to projects that achieve high CE (i.e. a low cost per ton of emissions reduced) compared to other applicant projects. The Air District's CE worksheet predicts the amount of reductions each project will achieve in ROG, NO<sub>x</sub>, PM, and CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. However, the Air District's calculation only includes the reductions in ROG, NO<sub>x</sub>, and PM per TFCA dollar spent on the project. The Transportation Authority will also give priority to projects that achieve high CE for CO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions based on data available from the Air District's CE worksheets. The reduction of transportation-related CO<sub>2</sub> emissions is consistent with the City and County of San Francisco's 2013 *Climate Action Strategy*.

**Project Readiness** – Priority will be given to projects that are ready to proceed and have a realistic implementation schedule, budget, and funding package. Projects that cannot realistically commence in calendar year 2019 or earlier (e.g. to order or accept delivery of vehicles or equipment, begin delivery of service, award a construction contract, start the first TFCA-funded phase of the project) and be completed within a two-year period will have lower priority. Project sponsors may be advised to resubmit these projects for a future TFCA programming cycle.

**Program Diversity** – Promotion of innovative TFCA projects in San Francisco has resulted in increased visibility for the program and offered a good testing ground for new approaches to reducing motor vehicle emissions. Using the project type criteria established above, the Transportation Authority will continue to develop an annual program that contains a diversity of project types and approaches and serves multiple constituencies. The Transportation Authority believes that this diversity contributes significantly to public acceptance of and support for the TFCA program.

**Other Considerations** – Projects that are ranked high in accordance with the above local expenditure criteria may be lowered in priority or restricted from receiving TFCA funds if either of the following conditions applies or has applied during Fiscal Years 2016/17 or 2017/18:

- **Monitoring and Reporting** – Project sponsor has failed to fulfill monitoring and reporting requirements for any previously funded TFCA project.
- **Implementation of Prior Project(s)** – Project sponsor has a signed Funding Agreement for a TFCA project that has not shown sufficient progress; the project sponsor has not implemented the project by the project completion date without formally receiving a time extension from the Transportation Authority; or the project sponsor has violated the terms of the funding agreement.

San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
 Draft Fiscal Year 2018/2019 TFCA Program of Projects – Detailed Staff Recommendations

| PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR TFCA FUNDS [sorted by cost-effectiveness (CE) ratio] |   |          |                           |                 |                       |   |                    |                       |                      |  |
|---|---|----------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|---|--------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|--|
| No. Sponsor <sup>1</sup>  | Project Description   | District | Project Type <sup>2</sup> | Prop K Eligible | CE Ratio <sup>3</sup> | CO <sub>2</sub> Tons Reduced <sup>4</sup> | Total Project Cost | TFCA Amount Requested | TFCA Amount Proposed |  |
| 1   | SFE<br><b>Emergency Ride Home</b> - Provides a free or low cost ride home in cases of emergency for employees who use alternative modes to get to work. The ride comes in the form of taxi, carshare or rental car reimbursement to employees of businesses participating in the program when a supervisor-approved unscheduled overtime or an emergency situation occurs. This program provides one year of funding for processing employer registrations and reimbursements.  | Citywide | 1                         | Yes             | \$15,064              | 1,814.2                                   | \$50,734           | \$50,734              | \$ 50,734            |  |
| 2   | SFSU<br><b>Bike Cage at SF State Thornton Hall</b> - The Thornton Hall bicycle storage cage will provide secure storage for 118 bicycles. The cage will use an automated door with card access to provide 24-hour access. SF State affiliates will gain access using their campus ID cards and members of the public will be able to request a card for access. The locker will contain racks, basic repair tools and an air pump.  | 7        | 1                         | Yes             | \$225,521             | 71.9                                      | \$40,069           | \$40,069              | \$ 40,069            |  |
| 3   | EVgo<br><b>Off-Street Car Share Electrification - DC Fast Chargers</b> - SFE is collaborating with EVgo, an electric car charger operator, and Maven, a carshare company, to provide the first all-electric carshare vehicle option in San Francisco. This project would provide 2 DC Fast Chargers at a to be determined location in central San Francisco for Maven carshare vehicles. EVgo will work with SFE and the Planning Department to identify the two designated car share spaces.<br><b>Requires TFCA Policy Waiver</b> - Funding this project requires a waiver from the Bay Area Air Quality Management District to allow the chargers to be dedicated for carshare vehicles instead of publicly available to any electric vehicle. Electric carshare vehicles require that the charger be available once the user returns the car to the designated carshare parking spot. A decision on the waiver is expected in Fall 2018. If the waiver is not approved by the Air District, we will add the funds to the reserve for reprogramming. | TBD      | 3                         | No              | \$239,735             | 544.1                                     | \$182,200          | \$127,200             | \$ 127,200           |  |
| 4   | ABM Parking Service<br><b>Grace Cathedral DC Fast Chargers</b> - The Grace Cathedral parking garage has 120 self park spaces. The garage is used by monthly parkers, tourists, church members, employees of the Cathedral and neighboring businesses. Grace Cathedral would install two DC Fast chargers for electric vehicles. The chargers would be installed near existing power panels (1200 AMPs). The chargers would be available seven days a week.  | 3        | 3                         | No              | \$246,203             | 708.1                                     | \$170,000          | \$170,000             | \$ 170,000           |  |

**TOTAL \$443,003 \$388,003 \$388,003**  
 Total TFCA Funding Available for Projects: \$764,243  
 Reserve (to be programmed through a second call for projects and approved by the Board by November 2, 2018) \$ 376,240

San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
Draft Fiscal Year 2018/2019 TFCA Program of Projects – Detailed Staff Recommendations

**TABLE B. PROJECTS NOT RECOMMENDED FOR TFCA FUNDS**

| No. Sponsor <sup>1</sup> | Project Description   | District | Project Type <sup>2</sup> | Prop K Eligible | CE Ratio <sup>3</sup> | CO <sub>2</sub> Tons Reduced <sup>4</sup> | Total Project Cost | TFCA Amount Requested | TFCA Amount Proposed |
|--------------------------|---|----------|---------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|---|--------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|
| 1                        | <p><b>Dynamic Carpool Pickup Curbs</b> - Project would create new passenger pickup curb zones in the downtown that provide safe, convenient and preferential locations for drivers to pick up passengers traveling eastbound on the Bay Bridge primarily during the evening commute. Project seeks to reduce travel times, idling, and conflicts with public transit, pedestrians and cyclists. Beyond promoting traditional casual carpool activity, these curb zones could stimulate the adoption of smartphone carpool matching services and make carpooling a more convenient option.</p> <p><b>Project Does Not Meet CE Ratio Requirement, Making It Ineligible to Receive Funds:</b> To be cost-effective, the project would need to result in nearly double the number of current casual carpool users, which is unlikely given that there is no cost-savings or time-savings incentives to encourage single-occupant vehicle drivers to carpool. In addition, the people joining new carpools in the evening commute are likely to be transit riders, in which case these new carpools would not reduce emissions from car trips.</p> | 3, 6     | 2 or 4                    | Yes             | \$237,480             | 1733.6                                    | \$3,443,674        | \$764,243             | \$ -                 |
| 2                        | <p><b>Ford GoBike Memberships for SF State Students</b> - San Francisco State University is requesting funds for a 2-year pilot program that will provide free "Bike Share for All!" memberships to Ford GoBike for up to 400 Pell Grant-eligible students at San Francisco State University. It will also provide 150 free yearly passes and 300 single month passes for students who are not Pell-Grant eligible.</p> <p>We are not recommending FY 2018/19 TFCA funds for the Ford GoBike Memberships for SF State Students project to be consistent with past Board policy direction, and at the request of Chair Peskin, that these public funds are not to be used on rides provided by Transportation Network Companies (TNCs such as Lyft and Uber). At its June 2017 meeting, the Transportation Authority Board approved FY 2017/18 TFCA funds for the Emergency Ride Home program with the condition that the TFCA funds are not to be used on rides provided by TNCs. On July 2, 2018, Lyft announced that it has acquired Motivate, the operator of Ford GoBike.</p>   | 7        | 1                         | No              | \$73,416              | 311.5                                     | \$56,500           | \$ -                  | \$ -                 |
| <b>Total:</b>            |   |          |                           |                 |                       |   |                    | \$56,500              | \$ -                 |

Project Exceeds Air District's \$150,000 per ton of emissions reduced threshold for rideshare projects and is therefore, ineligible to receive funds.

<sup>1</sup> Sponsor acronyms include Department of the Environment (SFE), San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and San Francisco State University (SFSU).

<sup>2</sup> Priority based on project type is established in the Local Expenditure Criteria, with zero-emissions non-vehicle projects as the highest priority, followed by shuttle services, followed in turn by alternative fuel vehicle projects, and finally any other eligible project.

<sup>3</sup> The TFCA cost effectiveness ratio (CE) is designed to measure the cost effectiveness of a project in reducing motor vehicle air pollutant emissions and to encourage projects that contribute funding from non-TFCA sources. CE ratio limits vary by project type: for FY 18/19 the limit for Ridesharing/Trip Reduction Projects, which encompasses Emergency Ride Home, Ford GoBike memberships for SFSU Students, and Dynamic Carpool Pickup Curbs is \$150,000 per ton of emissions reduced, and the limit for the Bicycle Projects and Alternative Fuel Infrastructure categories is \$250,000 per ton of emissions reduced.

<sup>4</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction is based on tons of carbon dioxide reduced over the lifetime of the project. This figure is calculated in the cost effectiveness worksheet.



**Attachment 3**

**San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
Fiscal Year 2018/19 Transportation Fund for Clean Air County Program Manager Fund  
Summary of Draft Recommendations**

| <b>RECOMMENDED PROJECTS (sorted by cost-effectiveness (CE) ratio)</b> |   |                           |                       |                         |
|---|---|---------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|
| <b>Sponsor<sup>2</sup></b>  | <b>Project</b>  | <b>Total Project Cost</b> | <b>TFCA Requested</b> | <b>TFCA Recommended</b> |
| SFE   | Emergency Ride Home                                     | \$50,734                  | \$50,734              | \$50,734                |
| SFSU  | Bike Cage at SF State Thornton Hall                     | \$40,069                  | \$40,069              | \$40,069                |
| EVgo  | Off-Street Car Share Electrification (DC Fast Chargers) | \$182,200                 | \$127,200             | \$127,200               |
| ABM Parking Service   | Grace Cathedral Electric Car Chargers                   | \$170,000                 | \$170,000             | \$170,000               |
|   | <b>Totals:</b>  | <b>\$443,003</b>          | <b>\$388,003</b>      | <b>\$388,003</b>        |

**Total TFCA Funding Available for Projects:** \$764,243  
**Reserve (to be programmed through a second call for projects and approved by the Board by November 2, 2018)** \$376,240

<sup>1</sup>Projects are listed in ranked order by cost-effectiveness ratio.

<sup>2</sup>See Attachment 2 for acronyms and other notes.