



# Memorandum

Date: May 24, 2017  
 To: Transportation Authority Board  
 From: Anna LaForte – Deputy Director for Policy and Programming  
 Subject: 06/13/17 Board Meeting: Approval of the Fiscal Year 2017/18 Transportation Fund for Clean Air Program of Projects

<p>RECOMMENDATION    <input type="checkbox"/> Information    <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Action</p> <p>Approve the Fiscal Year 2017/18 Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) Program of Projects</p> <p>SUMMARY</p> <p>Program \$726,760 in TFCA County Program Manager funds for five projects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Emergency Ride Home (\$41,832 to San Francisco Environment)</li> <li>• Bike Share Phase 4 Expansion (\$255,000 to the SFMTA)</li> <li>• Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program (\$79,964 to the SFMTA)</li> <li>• Paratransit Sedans (\$270,000 to the SFMTA)</li> <li>• Short Term Bicycle Parking (\$79,964 to the SFMTA)</li> </ul> <p>As the San Francisco TFCA County Program Manager, the Transportation Authority annually develops the Program of Projects for San Francisco’s share of TFCA funds. Projects come from a portion of a \$4 vehicle registration fee in the Bay Area and are used for projects that reduce motor vehicle emissions. With \$726,760 available for projects, we are recommending fully funding three requests (Bike Share Phase 4 Expansion, Emergency Ride Home, and Paratransit Sedans) and partially funding two requests (Short-Term Bike Parking and the Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program) as shown in Attachments 2 and 3.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Fund Allocation</li> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Fund Programming</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Policy/Legislation</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Plan/Study</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Capital Project Oversight/Delivery</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Budget/Finance</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Contracts</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Procurement</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Other:</li> </ul> <hr/>
---	---

DISCUSSION

**Background.**

The Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) Program was established to fund the most cost-effective transportation projects that achieve emission reductions from motor vehicles in accordance with the Bay Area Air Quality Management District’s (Air District) Clean Air Plan. Funds are generated from a \$4 surcharge on the vehicle registration fee collected by the Department of Motor Vehicles in San Francisco. 40% of the funds are distributed on a return-to-source basis to Program Managers for each of the nine counties in the Air District. The Transportation Authority is the designated County Program Manager for the City and County of San Francisco. The remaining 60%

Agenda Item 8

of the revenues, referred to as the TFCA Regional Fund, are distributed to applicants from the nine Bay Area counties via programs administered by the Air District.

On March 7, 2017 we issued the Fiscal Year (FY) 2017/18 TFCA San Francisco County Program Manager call for projects. We received five project applications by the April 28, 2017 deadline, requesting \$1,116,832 in TFCA funds compared to \$726,760 available.

**Available Funds.**

As shown in the table below, the amount of available funds is comprised of estimated FY 2017/18 TFCA revenues, interest income, and de-obligated funds from completed and canceled prior-year TFCA projects.

<b>Estimated TFCA Funds Available for Projects FY 2017/18</b>	
Estimated TFCA Revenues (FY 2017/18)	\$736,049
Interest Income	\$1,882
De-obligated Funds from Prior Cycles	\$34,832
Total Funds	\$772,763
6.25% Administrative Expense	(\$46,003)
<b>Total Available for Projects</b>	<b>\$726,760</b>

Unused funds from earlier projects were de-obligated and made available for the 2017/18 call for projects. These funds came from four projects that were completed under budget over the past year and one project that was cancelled without any expenses having been reimbursed. The cancelled project, the San Francisco Environment sponsored University of San Francisco (USF) Bike Chalet, could not move forward because the revised project cost estimate exceeded funds available. We will remain in contact with USF as they develop alternate bike parking concepts. After netting out 6.25% for Transportation Authority staff administrative expenses as allowed by the Air District, the estimated amount available to program to projects is \$726,760.

**Prioritization Process.**

We evaluated the TFCA project applications following the Board adopted prioritization process for developing the TFCA Program of Projects shown in Attachment 1. The first step involved screening projects to ensure eligibility according to the Air District’s TFCA guidelines. One of the most important aspects of this screening was ensuring a project’s cost effectiveness (CE) ratio was calculated correctly and was low enough to be eligible for consideration. The Air District’s CE ratio, described in detail in Attachment 1, is designed to measure the cost effectiveness of a project in reducing air pollutant emissions and to encourage submittal of projects that leverage funds from non-TFCA sources. CE ratio limits vary by project type: for 2017/18 the limit for Ridesharing Projects, which encompasses transit and transportation demand management projects, is \$150,000 per ton of emissions reduced, the limit for the Bicycle Projects and Alternative Fuel Light-Duty Vehicles categories is \$250,000 per ton of emissions reduced and the limit for Bike Share projects is \$500,000 per ton of emissions reduced.

We performed our review of the CE ratio calculations in consultation with project sponsors and the Air District. The focus was to ensure that the forms were completed correctly, that values other than

## Agenda Item 8

default values had adequate justification, and that assumptions were consistently applied across all project applications for a fair evaluation. Inevitably, as a result of our review, we had to adjust some of the submitted CE worksheets. In these cases, we worked with the project sponsor to determine the correct CE ratio and whether or not it exceeded the Air District's CE threshold.

We then prioritized projects that passed the eligibility screening using factors such as project type (e.g., first priority to zero emission projects), cost effectiveness, program diversity, project delivery (i.e., readiness), and other considerations (e.g., a sponsor's track record for delivering prior TFCA projects). Our prioritization process also considered carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions reduced by each project. CO<sub>2</sub> emissions are estimated in the Air District's CE worksheets, but are not a factor in the CE calculations.

### **Staff Recommendation.**

Attachment 2 shows the five candidate projects and other information including a brief project description, total project cost, and the amount of TFCA funds requested. We are recommending fully funding three of the five candidate projects and partially funding the other two. Three of the five projects recommended for funding are zero emissions non-vehicles projects, which is the top priority project type in the Transportation Authority's prioritization criteria.

We are recommending full funding for Bike Share Phase 4 Expansion, Emergency Ride Home and Paratransit Sedans. We are recommending partial funding for Short Term Bike Parking, which is scalable and the least cost effective application, and for Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program, which is also scalable, a lower priority project type, and because a recent rule change has increased the maximum age and mileage of taxis, resulting in a temporary decline in demand for new vehicles.

**TFCA Policy Waiver Required:** The Paratransit Sedans project application for \$270,000 from the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) requires the Air District to waive certain TFCA policies so that the cost effectiveness of the project can reflect the air quality benefits of replacing existing medium-duty "cutaway" paratransit vehicles with light-duty hybrid vehicles. As written, the TFCA policies only provide for counting the emissions benefits of purchasing an alternative fuel vehicle in the same weight class as a gasoline vehicle that could hypothetically have been purchased instead, which would show a much smaller emissions reduction than the proposed project. We expect the Air District Board to decide whether to waive TFCA policy as requested sometime this fall. Should the Air District not grant the TFCA policy waiver, the SFMTA would not be able to move forward with the project. For this reason, we are recommending a contingency list to provide funds to fully fund Short Term Bike Parking and provide additional funds for the Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program, should the waiver not be granted.

### **Schedule for Funds Availability.**

We expect to enter into a master funding agreement with the Air District by July 2017 after which we will issue grant agreements for the recommended FY 2017/18 TFCA funds. Pending timely review and execution of the grant agreements by the Air District and project sponsors, we expect funds to be available for expenditure beginning in August or September 2017.

### FINANCIAL IMPACT

The estimated total budget for the recommended FY 2017/18 TFCA program is \$772,763. This includes \$726,760 for the five proposed projects and \$46,003 for administrative expenses. The latter is consistent with Air District rules, which allow the Transportation Authority to set aside up to 6.25% of each year's annual income to use for administrative expenses. Revenues and expenditures for the

## Agenda Item 8

TFCA program are included in the proposed Transportation Authority's FY 2017/18 budget, which will be considered for adoption by the Transportation Authority Board in June 2017.

### CAC POSITION

The CAC will consider this item at its May 24, 2017 meeting.

### SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIALS

Attachment 1 - FY 2017/18 TFCA Local Expenditure Criteria

Attachment 2 - FY 2017/18 TFCA Program of Projects – Detailed Staff Recommendation

Attachment 3 - FY 2017/18 TFCA Program of Projects – Summary of Staff Recommendation



## Attachment 1

### Fiscal Year 2017/18 Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA)

#### LOCAL EXPENDITURE CRITERIA (Adopted 2/28/17)

The following are the Fiscal Year 2017/18 Local Expenditure Criteria for San Francisco's TFCA County Program Manager Funds.

#### ELIGIBILITY SCREENING

In order for projects to be considered for funding, they must meet the eligibility requirements established by the Air District's TFCA County Program Manager Fund Policies for Fiscal Year 2017/18. Consistent with the policies, a key factor in determining eligibility is a project's cost effectiveness (CE) ratio. The TFCA CE ratio is designed to measure the cost effectiveness of a project in reducing motor vehicle air pollutant emissions and to encourage projects that contribute funding from non-TFCA sources. TFCA funds budgeted for the project are divided by the project's estimated emissions reduction. The estimated reduction is the weighted sum of reactive organic gases (ROG), oxides of nitrogen (NOx), and particulate matter (PM) emissions that will be reduced over the effective life of the project, as defined by the Air District's guidelines.

TFCA CE is calculated by inputting information provided by the applicant into the Air District's CE worksheets. Transportation Authority staff will be available to assist project sponsors with these calculations, and will work with Air District staff and the project sponsors as needed to verify reasonableness of input variables. The worksheets also calculate reductions in carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) emissions, which are not included in the Air District's official CE calculations, but which the Transportation Authority considers in its project prioritization process.

**Consistent with the Air District's Guidelines, in order to be eligible for Fiscal Year 2017/18 TFCA funds, a project must meet the CE ratio for emissions (i.e., ROG, NOx, and PM) reductions as specified in the guidelines for each project type. Projects that do not meet the appropriate CE threshold cannot be considered for funding.**

#### PROJECT PRIORITIZATION

Candidate projects that meet the cost effectiveness thresholds will be prioritized for funding based on the two-step process described below:

Step 1 - TFCA funds are programmed to eligible projects, as prioritized using the Transportation Authority Board-adopted Local Priorities (see next page).

Step 2 - If there are TFCA funds left unprogrammed after Step 1, the Transportation Authority will work with project sponsors to develop additional TFCA candidate projects. This may include refinement of projects that were submitted for Step 1, but were not deemed eligible, as well as new projects. This approach is in response to an Air District policy that does not allow County Program Managers to rollover any unprogrammed funds to the next year's funding cycle. If Fiscal Year 2017/18 funds are not programmed by November 2017, funds can be redirected (potentially to non-San Francisco projects) at the Air District's discretion. New candidate projects must meet all of the TFCA

eligibility requirements, and will be prioritized based on the Transportation Authority Board's adopted Local Priorities.

#### Local Priorities

The Transportation Authority's Local Priorities for prioritizing TFCA funds include the following factors:

**Project Type** – In order of priority:

- 1) Zero emissions non-vehicle projects including, but not limited to, bicycle and pedestrian facility improvements, transit priority projects, traffic calming projects, and transportation demand management projects;
- 2) Shuttle services that reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT);
- 3) Alternative fuel vehicles and alternative fuel infrastructure; and
- 4) Any other eligible project.

**Emissions Reduced and Cost Effectiveness** – Priority will be given to projects that achieve high CE (i.e. a low cost per ton of emissions reduced) compared to other applicant projects. The Air District's CE worksheet predicts the amount of reductions each project will achieve in ROG, NO<sub>x</sub>, PM, and CO<sub>2</sub> emissions. However, the Air District's calculation only includes the reductions in ROG, NO<sub>x</sub>, and PM per TFCA dollar spent on the project. The Transportation Authority will also give priority to projects that achieve high CE for CO<sub>2</sub> emission reductions based on data available from the Air District's CE worksheets. The reduction of transportation-related CO<sub>2</sub> emissions is consistent with the City and County of San Francisco's 2013 *Climate Action Strategy*.

**Project Delivery** – Priority will be given to projects that are ready to proceed and have a realistic implementation schedule, budget, and funding package. Projects that cannot realistically commence in calendar year 2018 or earlier (e.g. to order or accept delivery of vehicles or equipment, begin delivery of service, award a construction contract, start the first TFCA-funded phase of the project) and be completed within a two-year period will have lower priority. Project sponsors may be advised to resubmit these projects for a future TFCA programming cycle.

**Program Diversity** – Promotion of innovative TFCA projects in San Francisco has resulted in increased visibility for the program and offered a good testing ground for new approaches to reducing motor vehicle emissions. Using the project type criteria established above, the Transportation Authority will continue to develop an annual program that contains a diversity of project types and approaches and serves multiple constituencies. The Transportation Authority believes that this diversity contributes significantly to public acceptance of and support for the TFCA program.

**Other Considerations** – Projects that are ranked high in accordance with the above local expenditure criteria may be lowered in priority or restricted from receiving TFCA funds if either of the following conditions applies or has applied during Fiscal Years 2015/16 or 2016/17:

- **Monitoring and Reporting** – Project sponsor has failed to fulfill monitoring and reporting requirements for any previously funded TFCA project.
- **Implementation of Prior Project(s)** – Project sponsor has a signed Funding Agreement for a TFCA project that has not shown sufficient progress; the project sponsor has not implemented the project by the project completion date without formally receiving a time extension from the Transportation Authority; or the project sponsor has violated the terms of the funding agreement.

Attachment 2  
 San Francisco County Transportation Authority  
 Draft Fiscal Year 2017/18 TFCA Program of Projects – Detailed Staff Recommendation

PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR TFCA FUNDS [sorted by cost-effectiveness (CE) ratio]										
No.	Sponsor <sup>1</sup>	Project Description	District	Project Type <sup>2</sup>	Prop K Eligible	CE Ratio <sup>3</sup>	CO <sub>2</sub> Tons Reduced <sup>4</sup>	Total Project Cost	TFCA Amount Requested	TFCA Amount Proposed
1	SFE	<b>Emergency Ride Home</b> - Provides a free or low cost ride home in cases of emergency for employees who use alternative modes to get to work. The ride comes in the form of taxi, carshare or rental car reimbursement to employees of businesses participating in the program when a supervisor-approved unscheduled overtime or an emergency situation occurs. This program provides one year of funding for processing employer registrations and reimbursements.	Citywide	1	Yes	\$13,604	1656.4	\$41,832	\$41,832	\$ 41,832
2	SFMTA	<b>Bike Share Phase 4 Expansion</b> - The SFMTA will review station sites and designs, legislate curb and parking changes if needed, and issue bike share station and special traffic permits for an additional 96 stations/1,350 bikes in San Francisco as part of the Ford GoBike.	1, 2, 4, 5, 7, 11	1	Yes	\$36,202	3708.1	\$318,000	\$255,000	\$ 255,000
3	SFMTA	<b>Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program</b> - This project is an Alternative Fuel Rebate/Incentive Program for new vehicles. Under this program, taxicab companies will have the opportunity to purchase new alternative fuel vehicles (hybrid, CNG, or electric) and will be able to submit proof of purchase materials to receive a rebate of up to \$3,900. Our recommendation is to partially fund this request. A recent rule change has increased the maximum allowed age and mileage of taxis, resulting in a temporary decrease in demand for new vehicles. The SFMTA has an existing TFCA grant for this program that it is spending down more slowly than anticipated.	Citywide	3	No	\$66,539	973.16188	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$ 79,964
4	SFMTA	<b>Paratransit Sedans</b> - Replace ten (10) aging SF Paratransit diesel and gasoline cutaway vehicles (22' vans) with hybrid sedans. SFMTA's paratransit fleet is currently 100% the larger, wheelchair accessible vehicles; however, approximately 70% of SF Access riders are ambulatory riders who do not require a wheelchair lift, and may actually be more comfortable riding in a sedan. <b>Requires TFCA Policy Waiver</b> - Funding this project requires a waiver from the Bay Area Air Quality Management District to allow the cost-effectiveness ratio to reflect the emissions reductions of replacing the actual, existing cutaway vans, rather than hypothetical gasoline vehicles in the same weight class as the proposed hybrid sedans. A decision on the waiver is expected in Fall 2017.	Citywide	3	Yes	\$108,400	347.3	\$300,000	\$270,000	\$ 270,000
5	SFMTA	<b>Short Term Bicycle Parking</b> - Bicycle parking spaces provide end-of-trip facilities for new bicycle trips thereby replacing vehicle trips and reducing motor vehicle emissions. This project would plan, design, and install 600 previously purchased bicycle parking racks in San Francisco, providing an additional 1200 bicycle parking spaces. Our recommendation is to partially fund this project due to the limited funds available. This would result in 160 racks or 320 parking spaces being installed.	Citywide	1	Yes	\$249,053	130.0	\$511,866	\$300,000	\$ 79,964

**TOTAL \$1,421,698 \$1,116,832 \$726,760**  
 Total TFCA Funding Available for Projects: \$726,760  
 Surplus/(Shortfall) \$ -

No.	Sponsor <sup>1</sup>	Project Description	District	Project Type <sup>2</sup>	Prop K Eligible	CE Ratio <sup>3</sup>	CO <sub>2</sub> Tons Reduced <sup>4</sup>	Total Project Cost	TFCA Amount Requested	TFCA Amount Proposed
-----	----------------------	---------------------	----------	---------------------------	-----------------	-----------------------	---	--------------------	-----------------------	----------------------

**TABLE B. PROJECTS RECOMMENDED FOR TFCA FUNDS CONTINGENT ON AVAILABILITY OF ADDITIONAL FUNDS**

Funding for these projects is contingent upon the Air District rejecting the requested TFCA policy waiver for the Paratransit Sedans project, which would then not be funded.

1	SFMTA	<b>Short Term Bicycle Parking (Additional Funds)</b> - Fully fund the Short Term Bicycle Parking request (see above). Additional funds would fund the installation of an additional 440 racks, for a grand total of 600 racks/1200 parking spaces.	Citywide	1	Yes	\$249,053	357.6	See above.	See above.	\$ 220,036
2	SFMTA	<b>Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program (Additional Funds)</b> - Provide additional funds (for a total of up to \$130,000 of the \$300,000 requested) for the Alternative Fuel Rebate/Incentive Program (see above).	Citywide	3	No	\$66,539	608.1	See above.	See above.	\$ 49,964
<b>Total:</b>										<b>\$ 270,000</b>

<sup>1</sup> Sponsor acronyms include Department of the Environment (SFE) and San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA).

<sup>2</sup> Priority based on project type is established in the Local Expenditure Criteria, with zero-emissions non-vehicle projects as the highest priority, followed by shuttle services, followed in turn by alternative fuel vehicle projects, and finally any other eligible project.

<sup>3</sup> The TFCA cost effectiveness ratio (CE) is designed to measure the cost effectiveness of a project in reducing motor vehicle air pollutant emissions and to encourage projects that contribute funding from non-TFCA sources. CE ratio limits vary by project type: for FY 2017/18, the limit for Ridesharing Projects, which encompasses transit and transportation demand management projects, including Emergency Ride Home, is \$150,000 per ton of emissions reduced, the limit for the Bicycle Projects and Alternative Fuel Light-Duty Vehicles categories is \$250,000 per ton of emissions reduced and the limit for Bike Share projects is \$500,000 per ton of emissions reduced.

<sup>4</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> Reduction is based on tons of carbon dioxide reduced over the lifetime of the project. This figure is calculated in the cost effectiveness worksheet.



**Attachment 3**  
**San Francisco County Transportation Authority**  
**Fiscal Year 2017/18 Transportation Fund for Clean Air County Program Manager Fund**  
**Summary of Draft Recommendations**

<b>RECOMMENDED PROJECTS (sorted by cost-effectiveness (CE) ratio)</b>				
<b>Sponsor<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Project</b>	<b>Total Project Cost</b>	<b>TFCA Requested</b>	<b>TFCA Recommended</b>
SFE	Emergency Ride Home	\$41,832	\$41,832	\$41,832
SFMTA	Bike Share Phase 4 Expansion	\$318,000	\$255,000	\$255,000
SFMTA	Alternative Fuel Taxicab Incentive Program	\$250,000	\$250,000	\$79,964
SFMTA	Paratransit Sedans	\$300,000	\$270,000	\$270,000
SFMTA	Short Term Bicycle Parking	\$511,866	\$300,000	\$79,964
	<b>Totals:</b>	<b>\$1,421,698</b>	<b>\$1,116,832</b>	<b>\$726,760</b>

**Total TFCA Funding Available for Projects: \$726,760**

<sup>1</sup>See Attachment 2 for acronyms and other notes.